

**Central Administrative Tribunal  
Principal Bench, New Delhi**


**C.P. No. 422/2017  
in  
O.A. No. 2173/2014**

Today, this the 18<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2020

Through video conferencing

**Hon'ble Mr. Justice L. Narasimha Reddy, Chairman  
Hon'ble Mr. A. K. Bishnoi, Member (A)**

1. All India BSNL Pensioners Welfare Association  
(Regd.No.1833/09)  
Through Roshan Lal Kapoor,  
Legal Committee Member  
17/64, First Floor, Geeta Colony, Delhi-110031.  
Presently at :  
LG-01, Lower Ground Floor, Tower 7,  
Civitech Florencia,  
Park Sapphire, Vaishali Extn., Sector – 9,  
Ramprastha Greens, I.E. Sahibabad,  
Ghaziabad (UP) 201 010.
2. Shri Ved Prakash Gupta,  
Ex. Sr. SSO CTO,  
New Delhi (Retd. on 31.10.2000)  
17-F, Pocket-IV, Mayur Vihar, Phase-I,  
Delhi-110 091.
3. Shri R. Ranganathan,  
Ex. Chief Telegraph Master, Retd. on 30.11.2000,  
40, First Main Road,  
Purushothaman Nagar Chromepet, Chennai
4. Shri G.R. Dharmarajan,  
Ex. Chief Telephone Operator  
(Retd. on 31.12.2000)  
No.3, Sekkilar Street Extn.,  
Bibikularm, Madurai-625 002

- 
5. Shri M.S. Murthukrishnan,  
Ex. SDE Chennai Telephones  
(Retd. on 31.01.2001)  
No.1, 26<sup>th</sup> Cross Street, Besant Nagar, Chennai
  6. Shri T.K. Sundaramoorthy,  
Ex. DE, RTTC, Chennai (Retd. on 28.02.2001),  
4, Shanti Nagar, 6th Street, Adambakkam, Chennai
  7. Shri Nabin Chandra Nayak,  
Ex. Sr. AO, Orissa (Retd. on 28.02.2001),  
N-1/253, IRC Village, CRP Square,  
Bhubaneswar-751 015
  8. Shri Roshan Lal Kapoor,  
Ex. ADG, DOT, HQ, New Delhi  
(Retd. on 31.03.2001)  
17/64, First Floor, Geeta Colony,  
Delhi-110 031
  9. Shri A.S. Ramachandraiah,  
Ex. CSS, Karnataka (Retd. on 30.04.2001)  
509, 65th Cross, 5th Block,  
Rajaji Nagar, Bangalore-560010
  10. Shri V. Ramachandran,  
Ex. SDE, Kerala Circle (Retd. on 31.05.2001)  
Thiruthi House, Kumaranpadi,  
P.O. Nirmaruthur, Malappuram, Kerala
  11. Shri U.S.N. Murthy,  
Ex. CSS, Andhra Pradesh (Retd. on 30.06.2001)  
G-2, Srinidhi Residency, Saptagiri Colony,  
Kukatpalli, Hyderabad-500 072
  12. Shri Vijai Kumar Rustogi,  
Ex. Sr. TM(T), CTO, N.D. (Retd. on 30.06.2001)  
B-184, Surya Nagar, Ghaziabad, U.P.

...Applicants

(By Advocate: Shri V.K. Sharma and Shri Neeraj  
Kumar Sharma)

**Versus**

1. Smt. Aruna Sundararajan,  
(Presently Sh. Anshu Prakash)  
Secretary, Department of Telecommunications,  
Ministry of Communications & IT,  
Sanchar Bhawan, 20, Ashoka Road  
New Delhi-110001
2. Shri Anupam Shrivastava  
(Presently Sh. P.K. Purwar)  
The Chairman-cum-Managing Director,  
Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited  
M.S. Mathur Lane, Janpath, New Delhi.
3. Sh. Bhanu Pratap Sharma  
(Presently Dr. Kshatrapati Shivaji),  
Secretary,  
Department of Pension & Pensioners' Welfare  
Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances &  
Pensions  
112/2, North Block, New Delhi – 110 001
4. Shri Ashok Lavasa  
(Presently Dr. T.V. Somanathan),  
Secretary, Department of Expenditure,  
Ministry of Finance, Room No.129-C,  
North Block, New Delhi.
5. Smt. Seema Bahuguna  
(Presently Sh. Sailesh),  
Secretary, Department of Public Enterprises,  
Block No.14, CGO Complex,  
New Delhi-110 003

... Respondents


(By advocate: Shri Rajeev Kumar and Shri R.V. Sinha)



**ORDER (ORAL)****Justice L.Narasimha Reddy, Chairman**

This Contempt Petition is filed alleging that the respondents did not implement the order dated 16.12.2016 passed by this Tribunal in OA.2173/2014. The OA was filed by an Association of pensioners of BSNL and some retired employees. It was in relation to the method of calculation of pension. Earlier, an order was passed by the department of Telecommunications on 15.01.2003 indicating the formula to be adopted. The said order was set aside and a direction was issued to the respondents to calculate the pension of the applicants in the same manner as is done in case of Central Government employees and employees of Public Sector Undertakings like FCI as contained in OM dated 18.10.1999. Almost at the same time at which the CP was filed, the respondents filed W.P.No.10019/2017. Taking that development into account the CP was closed on 08.02.2018. The Writ Petition has since been dismissed on 24.01.2020. Thereupon, the applicants filed MA.1341/2020 for revival of CP. That was ordered and the CP was revised on 19.08.2020, and it was directed to be listed after four weeks. On 06.10.2020 when





the CP was listed, there was no representation for the applicants, it was directed to be listed today.

2. When the case is called today, the learned counsel for Union of India sought time to file reply. Learned counsel for BSNL stated that it is a policy decision with serious implications and the issue is to be dealt with by the Government. We wanted to grant four weeks time to the Union of India to take steps in the matter. Learned counsel for the applicants Sri V.K.Sarma, however, seriously objected to that and insisted that the members of the Association are very old and matter cannot be delayed further. Therefore, we heard the matter in the absence of reply.

3. The direction issued by the Tribunal is to work out the pension of the members of the Association, who are thousands in number, in the same manner as is done in the case of the Central Government and the PSUs. The matter assumed finality only in the recent past. It is not known whether any SLP is been filed. Be that as it may, we dispose of the CP by directing the

respondents to implement the direction issued in the OA within three months from the date of receipt of a copy of the order.

There shall be no order as to costs.

**(A.K.Bishnoi)**  
**Member (A)**

**(Justice L.Narasimha Reddy)**  
**Chairman**

Sd/akshaya7dec/

